



South Carolina Commission on Higher Education

Mr. Kenneth B. Wingate, Chair
Dr. Bettie Rose Horne, Vice Chair
Ms. Natasha M. Hanna
Ms. Elizabeth Jackson
Dr. Raghu Korrapati
Ms. Leah B. Moody
Vice Admiral Charles Munns, USN (ret.)
Mr. Kim F. Phillips
Mr. Y. W. Scarborough, III
Dr. Jennifer B. Settlemyer
Mr. Rodney A. Smolla
Mr. Guy C. Tarrant, CCIM
Mr. Hood Temple
The Honorable Lewis R. Vaughn

Dr. Garrison Walters, Executive Director

CHE
03-01-12
Agenda Item 9.02.F

March 1, 2012

MEMORANDUM

To: Mr. Ken Wingate, Chair, and Members, S.C. Commission on Higher Education
From: Dr. Bettie Rose Horne, Chair, and Members, Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing

Consideration of Report on Program Productivity, Fall 2006-Fall 2010

Background

In 2002, the South Carolina Commission on Higher Education adopted a policy on program productivity which provides for the biennial review of enrollment and degrees awarded in all degree programs by all public four-year colleges and universities in South Carolina. The policy is on the Commission's website at http://www.che.sc.gov/AcademicAffairs/Prog_Productivity_Policies_11-2002.doc.

The attached report provides a list of academic degree programs that have been identified through the review process as non-compliant with program productivity standards based on enrollment and the number of degrees awarded during the review period. Institutions were asked to review the identified programs, comment upon their continued viability, and report their intended actions for resolving productivity issues. This fourth biennial report covers the 2006 to 2010 period and contains findings from the Commission on Higher Education Management Information System (CHEMIS) program data, responses from the institutions, staff analysis, and staff recommendations for the continuation or termination of the identified programs.

Evaluation Policy and Procedures

The policy and procedures for this biennial academic degree program productivity review are identical to those used in the 2006 and 2009 analysis. They require programs offered at public four-year institutions in the state to be evaluated in terms of rolling five-year averages for enrollment and degrees awarded. The following criteria apply:

1. Each baccalaureate program must either produce an average of at least 5 degrees awarded or enroll an average of 12.5 students (headcount) in the program over the most recent five-year period.
2. Each master's program must either produce an average of at least 3 degrees awarded or enroll an average of at least 6 students (headcount) in the program over the most recent five-year period.
3. Each doctoral program must either produce an average of at least 2 degrees awarded or enroll an average of at least 4.5 students (headcount) in the program over the most recent five-year period.

Data sources used for this review are CHEMIS and the Commission's *Academic Degree Program Inventory*. **Academic degree programs that meet at least one of the two productivity standards automatically receive continuing approval status from the Commission.** Programs which fail to meet both the enrollment and degree completion criterion for the biennial review are either placed on probation (i.e., provisional approval status), recommended for termination, or, in very rare circumstances, exempted from program productivity standards. Institutions may on their own initiative decide to terminate underperforming programs of study at any time by notifying the Commission on Higher Education.

During the period of probation of an academic program, an institution is expected to enhance degree program enrollment and degrees awarded. A plan to enhance productivity is required to be submitted to the Commission within 60 days of the Commission's action declaring the program's probationary status. At the end of a program's probationary period, which may extend over a four-year period of two biennial reviews, the Commission will recommend either continuing approval status for programs meeting program productivity standards or, except in extenuating circumstances, termination of programs that failed to meet the standards in three consecutive biennial reviews. If warranted, the Commission will remove probationary status from programs as early as the next biennial program productivity review.

The Commission will entertain individual program exemptions to the academic program productivity standards under very limited circumstances and then only if convincing justification can be provided. Programs approved for exemption must be 1) considered essential to the basic mission of the American university (i.e., the arts and sciences); 2) deemed so unique in their subject matter and value to the higher education community in South Carolina that at least one of them is essential to the State's program inventory; 3) considered pre-professional (e.g., Pre-Dentistry and Pre-Medicine) not as degree programs *per se* but as mechanisms for allowing students to leave the institution a year early for entering first-professional degree programs; or 4) represent "stop-out" Master's degrees for programs which typically graduate only at the doctoral level but provide "early out" opportunities to recognize students' accomplishments when they are unable to complete the terminal degree. It should be noted that any "uniqueness" criterion for exemption will rarely be applied to doctoral programs, which very infrequently duplicate each other and which have very modest productivity requirements (an average of 2 graduates per year or 4.5 enrolled students per year over a five-year period).

Program exemption requests may be filed for any degree level. They first must be approved by the chief academic officer and president of the institution and then sent in writing to the Commission. In most cases in which the Commission awards an exemption, it will be for the lifetime of the degree program. The awarding of exemptions is used very sparingly, however, because without a critical mass of students, even at the modest levels of the productivity standards, the quality of a program is too easily compromised in terms of curricular offerings, diversity of professors, student interactions, etc.

Summary of Process

For the current report, each university received a list of the non-compliant academic programs identified by the staff review for the 2006 to 2010 academic years. The institutions were requested 1) to review the list of programs; 2) to submit any corrections to the data; 3) and to inform staff whether each of the programs cited should be maintained, altered, terminated, or exempted from the policy.

In keeping with the 2009 guidelines for the program productivity review process, any program that received an average score no more than 0.2 points away from meeting enrollment or degrees awarded standards (as defined by the Commission) was rounded up to match the standard score and given full approval status.

Summary of Current Report Findings on Data from Fall 2006-2010

For the five-year period 2006-2010, this study found 742 programs of study eligible for analysis as programs which had been implemented for more than five years. Twenty of these programs (2.6%) were found to be non-compliant with enrollment and graduation standards, a decrease from the 2.9% of non-compliant programs identified in the 2009 reports. Across the State's thirteen public senior institutions, five (**Coastal Carolina University, College of Charleston, Lander University, Winthrop University, and USC-Beaufort**) achieved 100% compliance ratings for their academic programs of study. These institutions are to be commended for their level of achievement. **Coastal Carolina University, College of Charleston, Lander University, and USC-Beaufort** achieved total compliance in 2009 as well. Five institutions (The Citadel, Medical University of South Carolina, South Carolina State University, USC-Aiken and USC-Upstate) had only one program that was not compliant. Of the remaining institutions with non-compliant programs, two (Clemson University and Francis Marion University) had three that were not compliant, and one (USC-Columbia) had 9 programs that were not compliant.

In response to the program productivity data analyzed during this review, each institution was given the charge to determine the continued viability of their identified programs. As a result, USC-Columbia terminated five programs that were unsuccessful in meeting the required program productivity standards. These terminated programs are not included in the totals below. The Commission highly commends the University of South Carolina – Columbia for taking responsible actions in light of their respective programs' productivity performance.

Of the 20 non-compliant programs identified in this report, the sponsoring institutions *requested* that:

- 0 programs be *terminated*;
- 4 programs be recommended for *exemption*;
- 15 programs be granted *provisional approval*; and
- 1 program with no recommendation.

For these programs the Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing *recommends* that:

- 4 programs be *terminated*;
- 3 programs receive *exempt* status; and
- 13 programs be placed on *provisional approval* status.

Program-specific results, institutional responses, and staff recommendations are presented on pages 5-20 of this report. Summary tables of all of the data are provided on pages 21-23. Institutional responses are summarized in the text.

Table 1: Non-compliant Programs for Public Four-Year Institutions

| Degree Level | Program | CIP | Enrollment Average | Completions Average | Institutional Request | Staff Recommendation |
|--|-------------------------------|------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| The Citadel | | | | | | |
| Master | Mathematics Teacher Education | 131311 | 5.4 | 2.2 | Exemption | Provisional Approval |
| Clemson University | | | | | | |
| Master | Chemical Engineering | 140701 | 1.2 | 1 | Exemption | Exemption |
| Master | Chemistry | 400501 | 3.4 | 2.4 | Exemption | Exemption |
| Master | Operations Management | 520205 | 2.2 | 2.4 | Exemption | Exemption |
| Francis Marion University | | | | | | |
| Bachelor | Drama and Dramatics | 500501 | 12 | 2.6 | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval |
| Bachelor | International Studies | 450901 | 6.6 | 1 | Provisional Approval | Termination |
| Bachelor | Liberal Arts and Sciences | 240101 | 3.6 | 4 | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval |
| Medical University of South Carolina | | | | | | |
| Doctorate | Pharmacology | 261001 | 4.4 | 1.4 | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval |
| South Carolina State University | | | | | | |
| Master | Special Education | 131001 | 1.4 | 1 | Pending Request | Provisional Approval |
| University of South Carolina – Aiken | | | | | | |
| Bachelor | Liberal Arts and Sciences | 240101 | 6.2 | 4 | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval |
| University of South Carolina - Columbia | | | | | | |
| Bachelor | European Studies | 50106 | 4.2 | 0.8 | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval |
| Bachelor | Latin American Studies | 50107 | 5.8 | 1.4 | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval |
| Master | Software Engineering | 140903 | 1 | 0.2 | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval |
| Master | Conducting | 500906 | 3.4 | 1.4 | Provisional Approval | Termination |
| Master | French Language | 160901 | 5 | 1.8 | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval |
| Master | German Language | 160501 | 4.6 | 2 | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval |
| Master | Music History | 500902 | 2.2 | 0.2 | Provisional Approval | Termination |
| Master | Piano Pedagogy | 500999 | 4.6 | 2 | Provisional Approval | Termination |
| Doctorate | Music Theory and Composition | 500904 | 3 | 0 | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval |
| University of South Carolina – Upstate | | | | | | |
| Master | Special Education | 131009 | 4.2 | 2 | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval |

**THE CITADEL
Non-compliant Programs**

| Degree Level | Program | CIP Code | Enrollment Average | Completions Average | 2006 Status | 2009 Status | Institution Request | Staff Recommendation |
|---------------------|-------------------------------|-----------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|--------------------|----------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Master | Mathematics Teacher Education | 131311 | 5.4 | 2.2 | - | Provisional Approval | Exemption | Provisional Approval |

Total Reviewed Programs: 31

Non-compliant Programs: 1

Percent of Reviewed Programs that were Non-compliant: 3.2%

Institutional Request and Explanation:

The Citadel requests exemption for the program leading to the M.A.Ed. degree in Mathematics Teacher Education. The institution states that the program in the only non-certification masters program for mathematics teachers in the region combining education and mathematics content. The College has made a major commitment to building the sciences and mathematics in South Carolina by the establishment of the STEM Center of Excellence (Science Technology Engineering and Math). The Center has been successful in bringing students and teachers to the Citadel for “hands-on” learning experiences, and is expected to continue to be a major recruiting tool for the institution. The institution states that the program requires minimal additional resources because the majority of required and elective courses are offered as a part of the M.A.T. program.

Staff Response:

Staff acknowledges the Citadel’s effort to fill the need for the secondary mathematic teachers and commends the institution on the establishment of the STEM Center and the implementation of various other initiatives to improve enrollment and graduate averages in the mathematics teacher education. However, this non-unique program does not meet policy standards for exemption. As this program did not meet productivity standards in 2009 and remains out of compliance, provisional approval will give the program one reporting cycle to comply with program productivity standards.

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing’s Recommendations for The Citadel’s Program:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing commends favorably to the Commission *provisional approval* status for the program leading to the **Master of Education degree in Mathematics Teacher Education** at the Citadel. The Citadel’s planned initiatives to meet enrollment and completion productivity standards should be documented and submitted to the CHE within 60 days of the approval of this recommendation, with Commission Staff to report to the CAAL on plans submitted at the Committee meeting immediately after the 60-day period.

CLEMSON UNIVERSITY
Non-compliant Programs

| Degree Level | Program | CIP Code | Enrollment Average | Completions Average | 2004 Status | 2006 Status | Institution Request | Staff Recommendation |
|---------------------|-----------------------|-----------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Master | Chemical Engineering | 140701 | 1.2 | 1 | - | - | Exemption | Exemption |
| Master | Chemistry | 400501 | 3.4 | 2.4 | - | - | Exemption | Exemption |
| Master | Operations Management | 520205 | 2.2 | 2.4 | - | - | Exemption | Exemption |

Total Reviewed Programs: 154

Non-compliant Programs: 3

Percent of Reviewed Programs that were Non-compliant: 1.9%

Institutional Request and Explanation:

Clemson University request *exemptions* for the programs leading to the M.S. degree in Chemical Engineering, the M.S. degree in Chemistry, and the M.S. degree in Operations Management. The institution requests that CHE consider the recommendation of exemption from program productivity standards based on the programs' function as "stop out" program for students in the doctoral programs. According to Clemson officials, the Master's degree is awarded to students who were originally enrolled in the doctoral program but chose not to complete the terminal degree.

Staff Response:

The programs leading to the M.S. degrees in Chemical Engineering, Chemistry, and Operations Management represent "stop out" degrees for programs which typically graduate only at the doctoral degree level but provide opportunities to recognize students' accomplishments when they are unable to complete the doctoral degree. The precedent for this type of program is to grant an exemption.

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing's Recommendations for Clemson University's Programs:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing commends favorably to the Commission *exemption* status for the programs leading to the **Master of Science degree in Chemical Engineering, Master of Science degree in Chemistry, and Master of Science degree in Operations Management** at Clemson University.

FRANCIS MARION UNIVERSITY
Non-compliant Programs

| Degree Level | Program | CIP Code | Enrollment Average | Completions Average | 2006 Status | 2009 Status | Institution Request | Staff Recommendation |
|---------------------|-----------------------|-----------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Bachelor | Theatre Arts | 500501 | 12 | 2.6 | - | - | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval |
| Bachelor | International Studies | 450901 | 6.6 | 1 | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval | Termination |
| Bachelor | General Studies | 240101 | 3.6 | 4 | - | - | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval |

Total Reviewed Programs: 31

Non-compliant Programs: 3

Percent of Reviewed Programs that were Non-compliant: 9.6%

Institutional Request and Explanation:

Francis Marion University requests provisional approval for the program leading to the B.A. degree in Theatre Arts. The institution states that two of the most popular and effective instructors in the Theatre Arts Department were given additional teaching and administrative duties outside of the Theatre Arts Department, which has affected the number of Theatre Arts courses being offered. Both of the instructors have completed their additional assignments and a new tenure track faculty member was hired for the Theatre Arts program. The institution also states that the September 2011 opening of the new Francis Marion University Performing Arts Center is expected to improve recruitment of Theatre Arts majors and minors. Additionally, the program expects to increase enrollment with the enhanced recruitment of high school seniors to the Theatre Arts program.

Staff Response:

Staff acknowledges Francis Marion's effort to revise the program by implementing curricular changes, hiring new faculty, and developing enhanced initiatives to increase enrollment and completions. Staff agrees that the program's non-compliant status has not been a long-term problem, however it is important to remain vigilant to ensure the program stays on track with the required program productivity standards. Provisional approval will give the program two reporting cycles to comply with program productivity standards.

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing's Recommendations for Francis Marion University's Program:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing commends favorably to the Commission *provisional approval* status for the program leading to the **Bachelor of Art degree in Theatre Arts** at Francis Marion. Francis Marion's planned initiatives to meet enrollment and completion productivity standards should be documented and submitted to the CHE within 60 days of the approval of this recommendation, with Commission Staff to report to the CAAL on plans submitted at the Committee meeting immediately after the 60-day period.

Institutional Request and Explanation:

Francis Marion University requests provisional approval for the program leading to the B.A. degree in International Studies. The institution states that efforts made to attract a sufficient number of students to the major have failed. The faculty involved in this program will consider converting the program to a minor. The plan will be to continue the minor while allowing remaining International Studies majors to proceed toward graduation. In the 2012-2013 FMU catalog, the text pertaining to the major field would be removed, while the text describing the minor field would remain.

Staff Response:

Staff recognizes the institution's attempts to increase interest in the program completion and enrollment numbers, however, the productivity data demonstrates that this program was provisionally approved during the 2006 and 2009 reporting periods and remains out of compliance with program productivity standards for the third cycle in a row. Staff has determined that a recommendation of termination is appropriate given the institution's plan to convert the major in International Studies to a minor program.

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing's Recommendations for Francis Marion University's Program:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing commends favorably to the Commission *termination* for the program leading to the **Bachelor of Art degree in International Studies** at Francis Marion. Francis Marion's planned conversion of the program to a minor should be documented and submitted to the CHE within 60 days of the approval of this recommendation. In the interim, the current International Studies students will be allowed to proceed toward degree completion, with Commission Staff to report to the CAAL on plans submitted at the Committee meeting immediately after the 60-day period.

Institutional Request and Explanation:

Francis Marion University requests provisional approval for the program leading to the B.A. degree in General Studies. The institution states that the program is interdisciplinary and is assembled from existing courses at the institution and imposes little additional cost to the institution. The program is offered primarily for the benefit of adult learners who have earned numerous college credits at other institutions and in various disciplines over an extended period of time. A faculty committee reviews applications and rigorously controls entry into the program. Once a student is accepted, they are assigned an academic advisor who will assist them in choosing one of the following areas of concentration: Arts and Humanities, Social and Behavioral Sciences, Natural Science and Mathematics, or Management Technology. The General Studies program was developed as a small program with the intentions of targeting a specific audience and producing relatively few graduates.

Staff Response:

Staff acknowledges Francis Marion's effort to revise the program to increase enrollment and completions. South Carolina has a significant adult population who lack college degrees and could benefit from this program. Staff agrees that the program's

non-compliant status has not been a long-term problem, but encourages the institution to consider enhancing and expanding the current marketing strategies for the General Studies program. Provisional approval will give the program two reporting cycles to comply with program productivity standards.

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing's Recommendations for Francis Marion University's Program:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing commends favorably to the Commission *provisional approval* status for the program leading to the **Bachelor of Art degree in General Studies** Francis Marion. Francis Marion's planned initiatives to meet enrollment and completion productivity standards should be documented and submitted to the CHE within 60 days of the approval of this recommendation, with Commission Staff to report to the CAAL on plans submitted at the Committee meeting immediately after the 60-day period.

MEDICAL UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH CAROLINA
Non-compliant

| Degree Level | Program | CIP Code | Enrollment Average | Completions Average | 2006 Status | 2009 Status | Institution Request | Staff Recommendation |
|---------------------|----------------|-----------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Doctorate | Pharmacology | 2610011 | 4.4 | 1.4 | - | - | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval |

Total Reviewed Programs: 27

Non-compliant Programs: 1

Percent of Reviewed Programs that were Non-compliant: 3.7%

Institutional Requests and Explanations:

The Medical University of South Carolina requests provisional approval for the program leading to the Ph.D. degree in Pharmacology. The institution states that several of the program’s senior faculty members recently retired, which lead the Director of the pharmacy program to make a decision to suspend new graduate student admissions until a critical mass of faculty were in place. A new chairman and new faculty are now in place and the program is actively recruiting first year graduate students, through the College of Pharmacy’s program exposures, events, and laboratory rotations. Several new students are currently enrolled in the program.

Staff Response:

The staff agrees with the University’s decision to discontinue the admittance of graduate students to the program until a critical mass of faculty was in place. Staff encourages the College of Pharmacy to continue to enhance internal and external efforts to increase enrollment and graduation numbers. Provisional approval will give the program two reporting cycles to comply with program productivity standards.

The Committee on Academic affairs and Licensing’s Recommendations for Medical University of South Carolina’s Programs:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing commends favorably to the Commission *provisional approval* status for the program leading to the **Doctor of Philosophy in Pharmacology** at Medical University of South Carolina. Medical University of South Carolina’s planned initiatives to meet enrollment and completion productivity standards should be documented and submitted to the CHE within 60 days of the approval of this recommendation, with Commission Staff to report to the CAAL on plans submitted at the Committee meeting immediately after the 60-day period.

**South Carolina State University
Non-compliant Programs**

| Degree Level | Program | CIP Code | Enrollment Average | Completions Average | 2006 Status | 2009 Status | Institution Request | Staff Recommendation |
|---------------------|-------------------|-----------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|--------------------|----------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Master | Special Education | 131001 | 1.4 | 1 | - | Provisional Approval | Request Pending | Provisional Approval |

Total Reviewed Programs: 54

Non-compliant Programs: 1

Percent of Reviewed Programs that were Non-compliant: 1.8%

Institutional Request and Explanation:

South Carolina State University is currently applying its internal program review process for the evaluation of the program leading to the M.A.Ed. degree in Special Education, which has delayed the institution’s response to Staff’s request for additional program productivity information.

Staff Response:

Staff has determined that given the program’s 2009 productivity status, *provisional approval* will be appropriate for this program. The institution’s M.A. Ed. degree in Special Education was provisionally approved in 2009 and remains out of compliance with productivity standards. Failure to bring the program into compliance for the 2013 review will render this program eligible for a recommendation of termination. Provisional approval will give the program one reporting cycle to comply with program productivity standards.

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing’s Recommendations for South Carolina State University’s Program:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing commends favorably to the Commission *provisional approval* status for the program leading to the **Master of Education degree in Special Education** at South Carolina State University. SCSU’s planned initiatives to meet enrollment and completion productivity standards should be documented and submitted to the CHE within 60 days of the approval of this recommendation, with Commission Staff to report to the CAAL on plans submitted at the Committee meeting immediately after the 60-day period.

**USC-Aiken
Non-compliant Programs**

| Degree Level | Program | CIP Code | Enrollment Average | Completions Average | 2006 Status | 2009 Status | Institution Request | Staff Recommendation |
|---------------------|---------------------------|-----------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Bachelor | Liberal Arts and Sciences | 240101 | 6.2 | 4 | - | - | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval |

Total Reviewed Programs: 20

Non-compliant Programs: 1

Percent of Reviewed Programs that were Non-compliant: 5.0%

Institutional Requests and Explanations:

University of South Carolina – Aiken requests provisional approval for the program leading to the B.A. degree in Liberal Arts. The institution states that the faculty has reviewed and revised the Liberal Arts program to make it stronger. Admission of new students was suspended while the review occurred. One of the major program changes requires the student to work with an academic advisor and declare their major early in their academic careers. The faculty approved and supported revisions were implemented in Fall 2009, and the institution would like at least one additional reporting cycle before making a final decision on the program’s viability.

Staff Response:

Staff acknowledges USC-Aiken’s effort to revise the program and address the issue of enrollment and completion standards. Staff recognizes that this program imposes little additional cost to the institution; however, the relative cost of a program is not part of the standard for productivity status. Provisional approval will give the program two reporting cycles to comply with program productivity standards.

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing’s Recommendations for USC-Aiken’s Programs:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing commends favorably to the Commission *provisional approval* status for the program leading to the **Bachelor of Art degree in Liberal Arts and Sciences** at USC-Aiken. USC-Aiken’s planned initiatives to meet enrollment and completion productivity standards should be documented and submitted to the CHE within 60 days of the approval of this recommendation, with Commission Staff to report to the CAAL on plans submitted at the Committee meeting immediately after the 60-day period.

**USC-COLUMBIA
Non-compliant Programs**

| Degree Level | Program | CIP Code | Enrollment Average | Completions Average | 2004 Status | 2006 Status | 2009 Status | Institution Request | Staff Recommendation |
|--------------|------------------------------|----------|--------------------|---------------------|-------------|-------------|----------------------|----------------------|----------------------|
| Bachelor | European Studies | 50106 | 4.2 | 0.8 | PA | PA | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval |
| Bachelor | Latin American Studies | 50107 | 5.8 | 1.4 | PA | PA | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval |
| Master | Software Engineering | 140903 | 1 | 0.2 | - | - | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval |
| Master | Conducting | 500906 | 3.4 | 1.4 | - | - | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval | Termination |
| Master | French Language | 160901 | 5 | 1.8 | - | - | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval |
| Master | German Language | 160501 | 4.6 | 2 | - | - | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval |
| Master | Music History | 500902 | 2.2 | 0.2 | PA | PA | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval | Termination |
| Master | Piano Pedagogy | 500999 | 4.6 | 2 | PA | PA | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval | Termination |
| Doctorate | Music Theory and Composition | 500904 | 3 | 0 | - | - | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval |

Total Reviewed Programs: 221

Non-compliant Programs: 9

Percent of Reviewed Programs that were Non-compliant: 4.0%

Institutional Requests and Explanations:

USC-Columbia requests *provisional approval* for the program leading to the B.A. degree in European Studies. The institution indicates that the program is unique in that USC has the only European Studies program in South Carolina and that it is one of a few interdisciplinary programs at the university. The program has experienced a gradual but steady growth of (4) students in 2008 to (10) students this productivity cycle. The institution believes that the renewed interest in the *Introduction to European Studies* course has lead to the program's steady undergraduate enrollment since 2008. The program has made some strides in increasing the enrollment numbers by sponsoring various events such as conferences, lectures, and movie screenings that are of interest to students, faculty and the community.

Staff Response:

Staff recognizes the institution's attempts at increasing the program completion and enrollment numbers, however, the program failed to meet program productivity requirements in 2004, 2006, and 2009. While USC-Columbia has the only program leading to the B.A. degree in European Studies in the state, it is not the only university offering an extensive curriculum in the area. The productivity data demonstrates that this program was provisionally approved during the 2004, 2006 and 2009 reporting periods and remains out of compliance with program productivity standards for the fourth cycle in a row. While the productivity policy allowed for a recommendation of termination during the third cycle of not meeting program productivity, staff has determined that a recommendation of provisional approval is appropriate given the plans for substantive changes presented. Such approval gives the program an additional reporting cycle to comply with program productivity standards.

USC-Columbia requests *provisional approval* for the program leading to the B.A. degree in Latin American Studies. The institution states that the program has increased the number of enrollments and completions in the program. The program is interdisciplinary and requires minimal investment of time and resources because it has no dedicated faculty and only a part-time director based in another discipline. In 2009 program productivity report, the institution provided a plan to increase the enrollment which entailed reexamining the curricular requirements, increasing the number of scholarships available to program majors, and expanding involvement by faculty with professional interests in Latin American Studies. The institution responds that many of the plans outlined in the 2009 reports were not implemented because a new director was not hired until July 1, 2011. The institution believes that with the new director in place, they are now positioned to initiate the positive changes and conversations have begun with the program's 23 associate and affiliate faculty to discuss ways to implement the previous plans. The institution states that the Latin America Studies Program is one of only two in the state of South Carolina.

Staff Response:

The productivity data demonstrates that this program was provisionally approved during the 2004, 2006 and 2009 reporting periods and remains out of compliance with program productivity standards for the fourth cycle in a row. However, staff in the past recognized the institution's development of significant new plans to increase enrollment and completions. While the productivity policy allowed for a recommendation of termination during the third cycle of not meeting program productivity, staff has determined that a recommendation of provisional approval is appropriate given the plans for substantive changes presented. Such approval gives the program an additional reporting cycle to comply with program productivity standards.

USC-Columbia requests *provisional approval* for the program leading to the M.S. degree in Software Engineering. The institution states that several initiatives are underway that are expected to strengthen the Software Engineering program. The dual M.S.E. degree established in 2008 with the Tsinghua University in Beijing, China continues to be offered by the Computer Science and Engineering Department. This international agreement allows for students to begin an M.S.E. degree at Tsinghua and then transfer to USC for the last year (two regular semesters plus a summer), thereby satisfying the requirements for the USC

degree. The consortial arrangement did not begin as expediently as initially planned due to administrative processing delays. The issues have been resolved and the program is now in effect and has several Chinese students enrolled. Additionally, a cluster hire has recently been approved by the Provost, which will result in the hiring of one senior level faculty member in software engineering by Spring/Summer 2012.

Staff Response:

Staff recognizes the institution's efforts to increase the foreign participation in program; however, in the 2009 program productivity report, the institution set a one-year deadline for growth or termination of the program. While the Staff would recommend that the institution comply with their own recommendation of termination, we have determined that a recommendation of *provisional approval* is more appropriate given the plans for substantive changes above.

USC-Columbia requests *provisional approval* for the program leading to the M.A. degree in French Language. The institution states that the program is very close to the state standard minimum requirements. While the exact cause of the decline is not known, the graduate advisor suggests that students are taking longer to finish the degree because of economic necessity and the nature of foreign language study. Current enrollments in the program are up due in part to returnees from Fulbright study in France. The institution reports that the program now has between 8-10 students moving toward degree completion. Often students travel, work or study abroad to enrich their cultural and language skills. The M.A. in French is the only program of its kind in the state, and the program feeds into the Ph.D. program in Comparative Literature.

Staff Response:

Staff agrees with the institution's request for *provisional approval* for this program. This program was provisionally approved in 2009 and remains out of compliance with productivity standards. Failure to bring the program into compliance for the 2013 review will render this program eligible for a recommendation of termination. Provisional approval will give the program one reporting cycle to comply with program productivity standards.

USC-Columbia requests *provisional approval* for the program leading to the M.A. degree in German Language. The institution states that the program's increased Fall 2010 enrollment of seven students, the promising number of new applicants, and the promising anticipated number of Fall 2011 accepted students indicate that the program is on an upward trend. The program is also strengthened by an exchange agreement with the University of Bochum, Germany, and renewed ties with the University of Bamberg. The institution states that the M.A. in German is the only program of its kind in the state, and is in close cooperation with the Comparative Literature program at USC. This cooperation should continue to increase both the quantity and quality of applicants to the program.

Staff Response:

The staff acknowledges that foreign language programs are important to the state as well as to teaching and employment across many professions and agrees with the institution's request for *provisional approval*. However, this program was provisionally approved in 2009 and remains out of compliance with productivity standards. Failure to bring the program into compliance for the 2013 review will render this program eligible for a recommendation. Provisional approval will give the program one reporting cycle to comply with program productivity standards.

USC-Columbia requests *provisional approval* for the programs leading to the M.M. degree in Music History, M.M. degree in Conducting, and the M.M. degree in Piano Pedagogy. The Dean of the School of Music has received approval from the School's professional accrediting body, the National Association of Schools of Music, to merge all of the smaller Masters of Music programs into a single degree program with concentrations. This move will ensure that the major's enrollment average should meet the minimum standards in the next productivity cycle. In expectation of the proposed consolidation of the Master of Music degrees, the institution is requesting that these programs receive an interim exception to the program productivity standards. The institution requests temporary provisional approval pending CHE receipt of the program proposal for the single Master of Music. The proper notification of termination for the above listed MM programs will be provided to CHE pending consolidation of these options under more generic programs.

Staff Response:

The staff acknowledges and commends the efforts of the Dean of the School of Music to create a generic program leading to the Master of Music degree with concentrations. Staff recommends termination of the separate Master of Music programs and will await notification of termination. In the interim, current students in the music programs will be allowed to proceed toward degree completion, and the appropriate documentation should be submitted to the Commission.

USC-Columbia requests *provisional approval* for the program leading to the D.M.A degree in Music Composition. The institution states that student numbers have been affected by recent faculty retirements. The department will recruit new faculty in the near term and it is expected that student enrollments will increase. Increasing enrollment is a matter of high priority for the department, as this program is considered among the best in the Southeast. The DMA in Music Composition was a part of the USC's School of Music successful accreditation in 2010.

Staff Response:

Staff acknowledges the institution's explanation for the program's declining enrollment and completions. The institution is encouraged to continue to enhance the program's recruitment efforts. *Provisional Approval* will give the program two reporting cycles to comply with program productivity standards.

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing's Recommendations for USC-Columbia's Programs:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing commends favorably to the Commission:

1. *Provisional approval* for the programs leading to the:
 - Bachelor of Arts degree in **European Studies**;
 - Bachelor of Arts degree in **Latin American Studies**;
 - Master of Arts degree in **Software Engineering**;
 - Master of Arts degree in **French Language**;
 - Master of Arts degree in **German Language**; and
 - Doctor of Music degree in **Music Composition**.

For each program awarded *provisional approval*, USC-Columbia's planned initiatives to meet enrollment and completion productivity standards should be documented and submitted to the CHE within 60 days of the approval of this recommendation, with Commission Staff to report to the CAAL on plans submitted at the Committee meeting immediately after the 60-day period.

2. *Termination* for the programs leading to the:
 - Master of Music degree in **Music History**;
 - Master of Music degree in **Piano Pedagogy**; and,
 - Master of Music degree in **Conducting**;

USC-Columbia's planned termination of the programs leading to the Master of Music degree should be documented and the appropriate documentation submitted to the CHE within 60 days of the approval of this recommendation. In the interim, current students in the music programs will be allowed to proceed toward degree completion, with Commission Staff to report to the CAAL on plans submitted at the Committee meeting immediately after the 60-day period.

**USC-Upstate
Non-compliant Programs**

| Degree Level | Program | CIP Code | Enrollment Average | Completions Average | 2004 Status | 2006 Status | Institution Request | Staff Recommendation |
|---------------------|-------------------------------|-----------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Master | Education – Special Education | 131009 | 4.2 | 2 | - | - | Provisional Approval | Provisional Approval |

Total Reviewed Programs: 26

Non-compliant Programs: 1

Percent of Reviewed Programs that were Non-compliant: 3.8%

Institutional Requests and Explanations:

USC-Upstate requests provisional approval for the program leading to the M.Ed. degree in Education – Special Education. The institution states that a new Director of Graduate Programs for the School of Education has been appointed and recruiting has been identified and one of his major priorities. Four students are currently taking have begun taking classes and have begun the admissions application process the Special Education graduate program. Three of the students are applying for the Special Education – Visual Impairment Program. Seven students are on target to graduate from this program within the next year. From May 2011 – August 2011 four students have graduated from the program. The program has begun several efforts to increase enrollment in the program such as meeting with Enrollment Services to develop an action plan and working with Alumni Affairs and the Metropolitan Studies Institute to collect data about undergraduate program completers.

Staff Response:

Staff recognizes the institution’s efforts to increase enrollment in the Special Education program. Staff encourages the institution to continue to find ways to work with the faculty to improve enrollment and graduation numbers in this program. Provisional approval will give the program two reporting cycles to comply with program productivity standards.

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing’s Recommendations for USC-Upstate’s Programs:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing commends favorably to the Commission *provisional approval* status for the program leading to the **Master of Education degree in Education – Special Education** at USC-Upstate. USC-Upstate planned initiatives to meet enrollment and completion productivity standards should be documented and submitted to the CHE within 60 days of the approval of this recommendation, with Commission Staff to report to the CAAL on plans submitted at the Committee meeting immediately after the 60-day period.

**Table 2:
The Number of Non-Compliant Degree Programs Identified for the
Five-year Period, 2006-2010**

| Institution | Bachelor | Master | Doctoral | Total |
|----------------------------|-----------------|---------------|-----------------|--------------|
| Citadel | - | 1 | - | 1 |
| Clemson | - | 3 | - | 3 |
| Coastal CarolinaUniv. | - | - | - | - |
| Coll. of Charleston | - | - | - | - |
| Francis Marion | 3 | - | - | 3 |
| Lander | - | - | - | - |
| MUSC | - | - | 1 | 1 |
| SC State | - | 1 | - | 1 |
| USC-Aiken | 1 | - | - | 1 |
| USC-Beaufort | - | - | - | - |
| USC-Columbia | 2 | 6 | 1 | 9 |
| USC-Upstate | - | 1 | - | 1 |
| Winthrop | - | - | - | - |
| Total Non-compliant | 6 | 12 | 2 | 20 |

Total Programs: 742

Percent Non-compliant: 2.6%

**Table 3:
Staff Recommended Action Summary Table, 2006-2010**

| Institution | Termination | Exemption | Provisional Approval | Total |
|------------------------|--------------------|------------------|-----------------------------|--------------|
| Citadel | | | 1 | 1 |
| Clemson | | 3 | | 3 |
| Coastal Carolina Univ. | | | | |
| Coll. of Charleston | | | | |
| Francis Marion | 1 | | 2 | 3 |
| Lander | | | | |
| MUSC | | | 1 | 1 |
| SC State | | | 1 | 1 |
| USC-Aiken | | | 1 | 1 |
| USC-Beaufort | | | | |
| USC-Columbia | 3 | | 6 | 9 |
| USC-Upstate | | | 1 | 1 |
| Winthrop | | | | |
| Total | 4 | 3 | 13 | 20 |

**Table 4:
Non-compliant Degree Programs Identified for the Five-year
Period, By Field**

| Institution | Engineering | Foreign Language | Health Fields | Math | Music | Pre-Professional | Sciences | Social Sciences and Humanities | Teacher Education | Other |
|--|--------------------|-------------------------|----------------------|-------------|--------------|-------------------------|-----------------|---------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------|
| Citadel | | | | | | | | | 1 | |
| Clemson | 1 | | | | | | 1 | | | 1 |
| Coastal Carolina Univ. Coll. of Charleston | | | | | | | | | | |
| Francis Marion | | | | | | | | 3 | | |
| Lander | | | | | | | | | | |
| MUSC | | | 1 | | | | | | | |
| SC State | | | | | | | | | 1 | |
| USC-Aiken | | | | | | | | 1 | | |
| USC-Columbia | 1 | 2 | | | 4 | | | 2 | | |
| USC-Upstate | | | | | | | | | 1 | |
| Winthrop | | | | | | | | | | |
| Total | 2 | 2 | 1 | | 4 | | 1 | 6 | 3 | 1 |