May 3, 2007

MEMORANDUM

To: Dr. Layton R. McCurdy, Chairman, and Members, Commission on
             Higher Education

From: Dr. Bettie Rose Horne, Chair, Committee on Academic Affairs and
             Licensing, and Members

Report on Program Productivity, Fall 2000-Fall 2005

Background

      In 2002 the South Carolina Commission on Higher Education adopted a
new policy on program productivity, found at www.che.sc.gov, which provides for
the biennial review of enrollment and degrees awarded in all degree programs by
all public four-year colleges and universities in South Carolina.

      An initial study report for the years 1998 to 2003 was done in 2004. That
report found that of the 763 programs offered at the state's twelve public senior
universities, 40 programs (5.2%) were not in compliance with current program
productivity standards. Across the state's twelve public senior institutions,
**Coastal Carolina University, the Medical University of South Carolina
(MUSC), and USC-Aiken** were found to be in complete compliance with
program productivity standards, and they were recognized for achieving this
distinction. Institutions with the largest number of noncompliant programs in the
2004 study **were USC-Columbia (15), Clemson University (6), SC State
University (6), and Winthrop University (4)**. These institutions were requested
to supply—and did supply—a response for their non-compliant programs as well
as plans to raise productivity in those which were declared non-exempt.

      The attached 2006 report provides a list of academic degree programs that
have been identified in this study through the review process as noncompliant with

program productivity standards based on enrollment and the number of degrees awarded. Institutions were asked to review the identified programs, comment upon their continued viability, and report their intended actions for dealing with them.

This second biennial report covers the 2000 to 2005 period. It contains findings from the program data, responses from the institutions, and staff recommendations for the continuation or termination of the identified programs.

Evaluation Policy and Procedures

The policy and procedures for this biennial academic degree program productivity review are identical to those used in the 2004 study. They require programs offered at public four-year institutions in the state to be evaluated in terms of rolling five-year averages for enrollment and degrees awarded. The following criteria apply:

1. **Each baccalaureate program must either produce an average of at least 5 degrees awarded or enroll an average of 12.5 students (headcount) in the program over the most recent five-year period.**
2. **Each master's program must either produce an average of at least 3 degrees awarded or enroll an average of at least 6 students (headcount) in the program over the most recent five-year period.**
3. **Each doctoral program must either produce an average of at least 2 degrees awarded or enroll an average of at least 4.5 students (headcount) in the program over the most recent five-year period.**

Data sources used for this review are the Commission on Higher Education Management Information System (CHEMIS) and the Commission's *Academic Degree Program Inventory. Academic degree programs that meet at least one of the two productivity standards each two years automatically receive continuing approval status from the Commission.* Programs which fail to meet either the enrollment or degree completion criterion for the biennial review are either placed on probation (i.e., provisional approval status) or exempted from program productivity standards. Any non-exempt academic program that fails to meet both the productivity standards for three consecutive biennial reviews will be recommended for termination. Institutions on their own initiative may decide to terminate underperforming programs of study after any biennial review by notifying the Commission on Higher Education.

During the period of probation of an academic program, an institution is expected to enhance degree program enrollment and degrees awarded, based upon

a plan it is required to submit to the Commission within 60 days of the Commission's action declaring the program's provisional status. At the end of a program's probationary period, which may extend over a four-year period or two biennial reviews, the Commission will recommend either continuing approval status for programs meeting program productivity standards or termination of programs that failed in all three consecutive biennial reviews to meet the standards. If warranted by positive productivity data, programs on provisional status can be moved to full approval as early as the next biennial degree program productivity review.

The Commission will entertain individual program exemptions to the academic program productivity standards, if appropriate justification can be provided. Programs approved for exemption will be (1) considered essential to the basic mission of the American university (i.e., the arts and sciences); (2) deemed so unique in their subject matter and value to the higher education community in South Carolina that at least one of them is essential to the State's program inventory; (3) considered pre-professional (e.g., Pre-Dentistry and Pre-Medicine) not as degree programs per se but as mechanisms for allowing students to leave the institution a year early for entering first-professional degree programs; or (4) represent "stop-out" Master's degrees for programs which typically graduate only at the Ph.D. but provide "early out" opportunities to recognize students' accomplishments when they are unable to complete the terminal degree.

Program exemption requests may be filed for any degree level. They first must be approved by the chief academic officer and president of the institution and then be sent in writing to the Commission staff (see Procedure C.2 in the Policy). Normally, exemption status, once awarded, is for the lifetime of the degree program.

Summary of Process

In November 2006, each university received a list of the noncompliant academic programs identified by the staff review for the 2000 to 2005 academic years. The institutions were requested 1) to review the list of programs; 2) to submit any corrections to the data; 3) and to inform staff whether each of the programs cited should be considered for being maintained, altered, terminated, or exempted from the policy.

In keeping with the 2004 guidelines for the program productivity review process, any program that received an average score no more than 0.2 points away from meeting standard enrollment or degrees awarded scores (as defined by the

Commission) was rounded up to match the standard score and given full approval status.

Summary of Current Report Findings on Data from Fall 2000 – Fall 2005

For the five-year period 2000-2005, this study found 919 programs of study eligible for analysis as programs which had been implemented for more than five years. A total of 27 of these 919 programs (2.9%) were found to be noncompliant with enrollment and graduation standards, a reduction from the 5.2% of non-compliant programs identified in the 2004 reports. A summary of this data is found in **Tables 1, 2, 3**.

Across the State's thirteen public senior institutions, four (i.e., **the Medical University of South Carolina, College of Charleston, Lander University and USC-Aiken**) achieved 100% compliance ratings for their academic programs of study. The **Medical University of South Carolina and USC-Aiken** had also achieved total compliance in the 2004 report.

Of the 27 non-compliant programs identified in this report, the sponsoring institutions *requested* that:
- 3 programs be terminated;
- 9 programs be recommended for exemption;
- 10 programs be granted provisional approval; and
- 5 programs be granted full approval.

For these same 27 programs the CHE staff *recommends* that:
- 3 programs be terminated;
- 5 programs receive exempt status;
- 19 programs be placed on provisional approval status; and
- No (N = 0) programs be granted full approval status.

Program-specific results, institutional responses, and staff recommendations are presented on pages 5-18 of this report. Summary tables of all of the data are provided on pages 19-21. Institutional responses are summarized in the text.

Recommendation

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing recommends that the Commission approve this report and the individual institutional recommendations contained herein.

THE CITADEL
Noncompliant Programs

Degree	Program	CIP Code	Enrollment Average	Completions Average	2004 Status	Institution Request	Staff Recommendation
Baccalaureate	French	160901	5.6	1.6	Provisional	Termination	Termination
Baccalaureate	German	160501	10	2.8	Provisional	Termination	Termination

Total Reviewed Programs: 34
Noncompliant Programs: 2
Percent of Reviewed Programs that were Noncompliant: 5.8%

Institutional Response and Staff Analysis:

The Citadel indicates that the programs leading to the **Bachelor of Arts degree in French** and the **Bachelor of Arts degree in German** have attracted small numbers of very bright, talented students. The German program has produced six majors who were named Fulbright Scholars since 2001. The Citadel does not wish to lose for even a small number of their students the opportunities these academic majors have provided and can continue to provide. Given the importance of modern languages to the present and future state of competitiveness of the economy of South Carolina, *The Citadel requests termination of its programs in French and German* and proposes the consolidation of its three language programs into a Bachelor of Arts in Modern Languages with tracks in French, German, and Spanish. This program modification has already been submitted separately to the Commission under normal policy and procedures for the annual new and modified programs and has been approved by the staff as provided for in Commission policy.

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing's Recommendations on The Citadel's Programs:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing recommends that the Commission approve **Termination** for the programs leading to the:
- **B.A. degree in German**.
- **B.A. degree in French**.

CLEMSON UNIVERSITY
Noncompliant Programs

Degree	Program	CIP Code	Enrollment Average	Completions Average	2004 Status	Institution Request	Staff Recommendation
Baccalaureate	Pre-Dentistry Studies	511101	0	0	-	Exemption	Exemption
Masters	Animal Genetics	260804	5.8	1.6	-	Exemption	Exemption
Masters	Health Care Administration	510701	0.8	1.8	-	Termination	Termination
Masters	Biochemistry	260202	2	0.6	Provisional	Exemption	Exemption
Doctoral	Animal and Veterinary Sciences	260707	2.8	1.2	-	Approval	Provisional Approval
Doctoral	Computer Engineering	140901	4.4	1.6	-	Approval	Provisional Approval

Total Reviewed Programs: 186
Noncompliant Programs: 5
Percent of Reviewed Programs that were Noncompliant: 3.2%

Institutional Response and Staff Analysis:

In the 2004 program review, Clemson University explained that the Pre-Pharmacy and Pre-Veterinary Studies are not true degree programs. The same position is now presented by the institution with respect to its **Bachelor of Sciences degree in Pre-Dentistry**. If a student leaves Clemson prior to graduation because (s)he has been admitted for an admission to a professional program in a pharmacy, veterinary medicine, medical school, or dental school, Clemson will award the relevant undergraduate degree (e.g., Pre-Dentistry, Pre-Veterinary Studies) and report it to the Commission upon receipt of official notification from the relevant institution that the student has completed the first professional degree. The procedure for this process was approved in July 1974. This procedure is, according to the institution, applicable to the Pre-Dentistry program. *Clemson requests exemption for the Bachelor of Science in Pre-Dentistry.*

Clemson indicates that its programs leading to the **Master of Science degree in Animal Genetics** and the **Master of Science degree in Biochemistry** confer "stop-out" degrees awarded to students who cannot complete the requirements for the respective doctoral programs, but have completed sufficient coursework for a Master's degree. Students are not recruited into these programs with the intention of completing a Master's degree. An increase in the number of

Master's degrees awarded in these areas is not desirable. *Clemson requests an exemption for both of these programs*.

Clemson states that the ***Doctor of Philosophy in Animal and Veterinary Sciences,*** formerly called Animal Physiology, recently experienced the retirement of several senior faculty. Those impending retirements led to reduced numbers of graduate students and fewer assistantships. Replacement tenure-track faculty in this field generally has led to increased recruiting in all graduate areas and, specifically, in this program. The institution expects continued growth in enrollment and subsequent degree completion rates. The institution states that collaboration with the University of Georgia College of Veterinary Medicine will promote enrollment in this program. *Clemson requests full approval of the program leading to the Doctor of Philosophy degree in Animal and Veterinary Sciences.*

The institution states that the **Doctor of Philosophy degree in Computer Engineering** has increased the number of faculty in the program to nine and is committed to increasing the enrollment and completions in this program. The institution further states that the faculty will work closely with the Graduate School to develop a recruiting program for this program. Current enrollment shows no increase over the previous five-year average. *Clemson requests full approval of the program leading to the Doctor of Philosophy degree in Computer Engineering.*

*The institution requests termination of the program leading to the **Master of Health Administration degree in Health Care Administration**.*

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing's Recommendations on Clemson Programs:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing recommends that the Commission:
1. **Terminate** the program leading to **M.H.A. degree in Health Care Administration,** as per Clemson's request.
2. **Exempt** the programs leading to the:
   - **B.S. degree in Pre-Dentistry Studies**.
   - **M.S. degree in Animal Genetics**.
   - **M.S. degree in Biochemistry**.
3. **Provisionally Approve** the programs leading to the:
   - **Ph.D. degree in Animal and Veterinary Sciences**.
   - **Ph.D. degree in Computer Engineering**.

FRANCIS MARION UNIVERSITY
Noncompliant Programs

Degree	Program	CIP Code	Enrollment Average	Completions Average	2004 Status	Institution Request	Staff Recommendation
Baccalaureate	Economics	450601	12	3.4	-	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Baccalaureate	Modern Languages	160101	8	1.2	-	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Baccalaureate	International Studies	450901	5.2	0.8	-	Exemption	Provisional Approval

Total Reviewed Programs: 38
Noncompliant Programs: 3
Percent of Reviewed Programs that were Noncompliant: 7.9%

Institutional Response and Staff Analysis:

Francis Marion University recognizes that the program leading to a **Bachelor of Arts degree in Economics** and the program leading to the **Bachelor of Arts degree in Modern Languages** do not meet the enrollment and completion standards and *requests provisional approval for both programs*. The institution presents current enrollment data on both programs that clearly indicate growing enrollment. If the programs maintain or increase their current enrollment, as is predicted by the institution, they will meet standards at the time of the 2008 productivity review.

Francis Marion University states that the program leading to a **Bachelor of Arts degree in International Studies** is an interdisciplinary program that combines courses from other programs and imposes little or no additional cost on the University. Therefore, *Francis Marion University requests that the Bachelor of Arts in International Studies program be granted exempt status*. While staff recognizes that this program imposes little additional cost to the institution, the relative cost of a program is not part of the standard for productivity status. Part of the intent of the standards is to ensure that the students in a program can count on a critical mass of colleagues and a focused academic experience. It can be argued that the presence of the critical mass of fellow students is even more important to the academic experience in a program consisting of courses from multiple academic areas without a unifying institutional or faculty identity. Thus, the staff recommendation for this program is for provisional approval in order to encourage institutional attention on enrollment and completions.

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing's Recommendations on Francis Marion University's programs:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing recommends that the Commission **Provisionally Approve** the programs leading to the:
- **B.A. degree in General Economics**.
- **B.A. degree in Modern Languages**.
- **B.A. degree in International Studies**.

SC STATE UNIVERSITY
Noncompliant Programs

Degree	Program	CIP Code	Enrollment Average	Completions Average	2004 Status	Institution Request	Staff Recommendation
Baccalaureate	Social Sciences	450101	1.2	0.2	-	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Baccalaureate	Industrial Education	131309	6.6	1.4	-	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Baccalaureate	Art Education K-12	131302	5	0.2	Provisional	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Baccalaureate	Physics	400801	5	1.2	Provisional	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval

Total Reviewed Programs: 58
Noncompliant Programs: 4
Percent of Reviewed Programs that were Noncompliant: 6.9%

Institutional Response and Staff Analysis:

*SC State University requests provisional approval of its program leading to the **Bachelor of Arts degree in Social Sciences**.* The institution recognizes that the Bachelor of Arts degree in Social Sciences program does not meet productivity standards and is developing a plan to increase both enrollment and completions.

*SC State University requests provisional approval of the program leading to the **Bachelor of Science degree in Industrial Education.*** The institution documents faculty changes over the last two years, which it contends have resulted in greater faculty stability and increased the potential for student growth. The recruitment plan presented highlights faculty participation in recruiting efforts as a primary focus. The program was accredited by the Council on Technology Teacher Education in 2005.

*SC State University requests provisional approval of its program leading to the **Bachelor of Science degree in Art Education K-12**.* The institution explains that the Art Teacher Education program has hired a full-time tenure-track professor for the program, implemented a recruitment plan to include increasing the visibility of the major on campus, increased direct recruiting by faculty through presentations, and increased emphasis on the major as one for which forgivable loans are available.

*SC State University requests provisional approval of its program leading to the **Bachelor of Science degree in Physics**.* The institution states that the enrollment plan instituted in 2004 has resulted in current enrollment of 11 majors

in this area and that an "aggressive enrollment plan" is in place. This program received provisional approval in the 2004 program productivity review.

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing's Recommendations on SC State University's Programs:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing recommends that the Commission **Provisionally Approve** the programs leading to the:
- **B.A. degree in Social Sciences**.
- **B.S. degree in Industrial Education**.
- **B.A. degree in Art Education K-12**. *This program was provisionally approved in 2004 and remains out of compliance with program productivity standards. Failure to bring the program into compliance for the 2008 review will render this program eligible for a recommendation of termination.*

- **B.S. degree in Physics**. *This program was provisionally approved in 2004 and remains out of compliance with program productivity standards. Failure to bring the program into compliance for the 2008 review will render this program eligible for a recommendation of termination.*

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH CAROLINA, COLUMBIA
Noncompliant Programs

Degree	Program	CIP Code	Enrollment Average	Completions Average	2004 Status	Institution Request	Staff Recommendation
Baccalaureate	European Studies	50106	2	0.6	Provisional	Approval	Provisional Approval
Baccalaureate	Latin American Studies	50107	4.4	2.2	Provisional	Approval	Provisional Approval
Masters	Experimental Psychology	420801	2.2	2.2	-	Exemption	Exemption
Masters	Foreign Languages	160101	5.2	1.4	-	Approval	Provisional Approval
Masters	Jazz Studies	500999	0.2	0.2	-	Exemption	Provisional Approval
Masters	Piano Pedagogy	500999	3.0	1.0	-	Exemption	Provisional Approval
Masters	Political Science	451001	4.4	2	-	Exemption	Exemption
Masters	Music History	500902	1.2	0.4	Provisional	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Masters	Music Theory	500904	5.4	1.8	Provisional	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval

Total Reviewed Programs: 285
Noncompliant Programs: 9
Percent of Reviewed Programs that were Noncompliant: 3.1%

Institutional Response and Staff Analysis:

The institution indicates that it has the only European Studies program in South Carolina. There are only two courses unique to the program, both of which are being taught by a professor as an overload (i.e., with no extra compensation, and in addition to his normal teaching load). USC-Columbia has redesigned and implemented major curriculum changes in European Studies and has seen an increase in the number of double majors. The institution has plans to increase the number of scholarships available to program majors, revisit changes to the curriculum and expand faculty involvement. *USC-Columbia requests full approval for the program leading to the **Bachelor of Arts degree in European Studies***. Staff notes that part of why this program imposes little additional cost to the institution is owed to having a professor willing to teach two required courses in it without pay. This suggests that the University may wish to consider its level of resource commitment to this program. However, the relative cost of a program is not part of the standard for productivity. The intent of the standards is in part to ensure that the students in a program can count on a critical mass of colleagues and a focused academic experience. The plans in place to achieve the standards

are commendable, and if they can achieve their stated goals will serve to bring the program out of non-compliance.

USC-Columbia requests full approval for the program leading to the **Bachelor of Arts degree in Latin American Studies**. In order to increase visibility of the program, the Latin American Studies Program along with the other area studies programs have been administratively subsumed within the Walker Institute for International and Area Studies. Also, USC-Columbia has plans to reexamine the curricular requirements, increase the number of scholarships available to program majors, and expand involvement by faculty with professional interests in Latin American Studies. Finally, the name is to be changed to "Latin American, Latino/a, and Caribbean Studies" to reflect a broader scope within the major. As above, the plans in place to achieve the standards are commendable, and if they can achieve their stated goals will serve to bring the program out of non-compliance.

USC-Columbia requests exemption status for the programs leading to the **Master of Arts degree in Experimental Psychology** *and to the* **Master of Arts degree in Political Science**. These are "stop-out" degrees awarded to students who cannot complete the requirements for the respective doctoral programs but have completed sufficient coursework for a Master's degree. No student is recruited into these two degree programs; students are registered into the Ph.D. programs in Political Science and in Experimental Psychology. An increase in the number of Master's degrees awarded in these areas is not desirable.

USC-Columbia requests full approval for the program leading to the **Master's degree in Foreign Languages.** The institution's records indicate that they have enrolled a total of 38 students in the Master's degree in Foreign Languages over the past five years (5-fall 2002, 3-fall 2003, 11-fall 2004, 11 - fall 2005, and 8 - fall 2006). USC officials have affirmed that they are holding internal discussions to correct a data problem on this degree. A corrective plan of action will be completed by the end of April and sent to the CHE with a corrected data submission.

USC-Columbia requests exemption status for the programs leading to the **Master's degree in Piano Pedagogy** *and the* **Master's degree in Jazz Studies**. USC-Columbia is the only public institution offering these graduate level performance majors in the state. In 2004, staff conducted background research of similar programs at several universities. Although the programs would, if combined, still not meet productivity standards, the findings demonstrated that institutions across the nation typically do not offer these two degrees as tracks under one generic music degree program. In addition, the National Association of Schools of Music, which is the accrediting agency for these programs, in its

handbook designates programs in piano pedagogy and jazz studies as specific Master's degrees. Without the existence of these programs, there would be a void in these areas of study for students who are interested in pursuing degrees and careers in these fields. Commission staff agree with the stated need for strong programs in these areas of music studies. The institution should be encouraged to focus sufficient resources to bring them into compliance.

*USC-Columbia requests provisional approval status for the programs leading to the **Master's degree in Music History** and the **Master's degree in Music Theory.*** Neither of the degrees requires any courses unique to itself. All students in music are required to enroll in one or more courses in music history and music theory, and a variety of courses are available each semester. The Master of Music degree in Music History and Music Theory are appropriate for students who wish to pursue a Ph.D. in Music or students interested in teaching music at the collegiate level. The National Association of Schools of Music accreditation for music curricula lists specific master's degree that it accredits and requires that they are separately designated rather than forming part of a generic M.M. degree. Merging the two degree programs in Music History and Music Theory is not an option. Each of these programs is a unique program and the only one of its kind being offered by institutions in the state. Without their existence, there would be a void in these areas of study for students who are interested in pursuing degrees and careers in these fields. While staff recognizes the value of these programs, an institutional commitment of resources sufficient to increase enrollment and completion levels is commensurate with that value.

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing's Recommendations on the University of South Carolina-Columbia's Programs:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing recommends that the Commission:

1. **Exempt** the programs leading to the:
   - **M.A. degree in Experimental Psychology**.
   - **M.A. degree in Political Science**.

2. **Provisionally Approve** the programs leading to the:
   - **B.A. degree in European Studies**. *This program was provisionally approved in 2004 and remains out of compliance with program productivity standards. Failure to bring the program into compliance for the 2008 review will render this program eligible for a recommendation of termination in 2008.*

- **B.A. degree in Latin American Studies**. *This program was provisionally approved in 2004 and remains out of compliance with program productivity standards. Failure to bring the program into compliance for the 2008 review will render this program eligible for a recommendation of termination in 2008.*

- **M.A. degree in Foreign Languages**.
- **M.M. degree in Jazz Studies**.
- **M.M. degree in Piano Pedagogy**.
- **M.M. degree in Music History**.
- **M.M. degree in Music Theory**.

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH CAROLINA-UPSTATE
Noncompliant Programs

Degree	Program	CIP Code	Enrollment Average	Completions Average	2004 Status	Institution Request	Staff Recommendation
Baccalaureate	Mathematics	270101	11.4	1.2	Provisional	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval

Total Reviewed Programs: 35
Noncompliant Programs: 1
Percent of Reviewed Programs that were Noncompliant: 2.8%

Institutional Response and Staff Analysis:

*USC-Upstate requests provisional approval of its program leading to the **Bachelor of Science degree in Mathematics**.* The institution plans to institute measures to increase enrollment in this program, placing it in compliance with program productivity standards. Initiatives considered or already implemented include 1) merging the Computational Math program into the B.S. in Mathematics; 2) creating a proposed Industrial Mathematics concentration within the major; 3) sponsoring high-visibility math competitions for high school students; 4) hiring a Math Tutoring Director; and 5) enhancing assessment efforts for program improvement.

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing's Recommendations on the University of South Carolina-Upstate's Program:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing recommends that the Commission **Provisionally Approve** the program leading to the:

- **B.S. degree** in **Mathematics.** *This program was provisionally approved in 2004 and remains out of compliance with program productivity standards. Failure to bring the program into compliance for the 2008 review will render this program eligible for a recommendation of termination in 2008.*

<div align="center">

Winthrop University
Noncompliant Programs

</div>

Degree	Program	CIP Code	Enrollment Average	Completions Average	2004 Status	Institution Request	Staff Recommendation
Masters	Art Education	131302	4.4	1	Provisional	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval
Masters	Music Education	131312	3.2	1.8	Provisional	Provisional Approval	Provisional Approval

Total Reviewed Programs: 64
Noncompliant Programs: 2
Percent of reviewed programs that were Noncompliant: 3.1%

Institutional Response and Staff Analysis:

The institution states that the Dean of the College of Visual and Performing Arts is currently reviewing the **Master of Arts in Art Education** and the **Master of Music Education Music Education**. According to the response, Winthrop has taken action over the previous two years which has resulted in improved productivity in these programs to include increased student recruitment and changes in coursework. *Winthrop University requests provisional approval for the programs leading to the **Master of Arts degree in Art Education** and the **Master of Music Education degree in Music Education**.*

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing's Recommendations on Winthrop University's Programs:

The Committee on Academic Affairs and Licensing recommends that the Commission **Provisionally Approve** the programs leading to the:

- **M.A. degree in Art Education.** *This program was provisionally approved in 2004 and remains out of compliance with program productivity standards. Failure to bring the program into compliance for the 2008 review will render this program eligible for a recommendation of termination in 2008.*

- **M.M.E. degree in Music Education.** *This program was provisionally approved in 2004 and remains out of compliance with program productivity standards. Failure to bring the program into compliance for the 2008 review will render this program eligible for a recommendation of termination in 2008.*

Identified Degree Program Summary Tables
Table 1:

**The Number of Non-Compliant Degree Programs Identified for the
Five-year Period, 2000-2005**

Institution	Bachelor	Master's	Doctoral	Total
Citadel	2	-	-	2
Clemson	1	3	2	6
Coastal Carolina Univ.	-	-	-	-
Coll. of Charleston	-	-	-	-
Francis Marion	3	-	-	3
Lander	-	-	-	-
MUSC	-	-	-	-
SC State	4	-	-	4
USC-Aiken	-	-	-	-
USC-Columbia	2	7	-	9
USC-Upstate	1	-	-	1
Winthrop	-	2	-	2
Total Noncompliant	13	12	2	**27**

Total Programs: 919
Percent Noncompliant: 2.9

Table 2:

Staff Recommended Action Summary Table, 2000-2005

Institution	Termination	Exemption	Provisional Approval	Full Approval	Total
Citadel	2	-	-	-	2
Clemson	1	3	2	-	6
Coastal Carolina Univ.	-	-	-	-	-
Coll. of Charleston	-	-	-	-	-
Francis Marion	-	-	3	-	3
Lander	-	-	-	-	-
MUSC	-	-	-	-	-
SC State	-	-	4	-	4
USC-Aiken	-	-	-	-	-
USC-Columbia	-	2	7	-	9
USC-Upstate	-	-	1	-	1
Winthrop	-	-	2	-	2
Total	3	5	19	-	27

Table 3:

**Degree Programs Identified for the Five-year
Period, By Field**

Institution	Engineering	Foreign Language	Health Fields	Math	Music	Pre-Professional	Sciences	Social Sciences and Humanities	Teacher Education	Other[1]
Citadel	-	2	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Clemson	1	-	1	-	-	1	3	-	-	-
Coastal Carolina Univ.	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Coll. of Charleston	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Francis Marion	-	1	-	-	-	-	-	1	-	1
Lander	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
MUSC	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
SC State	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	1	2	-
USC-Aiken	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
USC-Columbia	-	1	-	-	4	-	-	3	1	-
USC-Upstate	-	-	-	1	-	-	-	-	-	-
Winthrop	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	2	0
Total	1	4	1	1	4	1	4	5	5	1

---

[1] Includes programs in Technical and Business Communication.